

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

President of Council Vanover called Council to order on July 20, 2022

The governmental body and those in attendance recited the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mrs. McNear provided the Invocation.

Mrs. McNear took roll call. Council members Anderson, Ghantous, Hawkins, Jacobs, Ramirez, Sullivan-Wisecup, and Vanover were present.

The minutes of the June 29, 2022 meeting were considered. Mrs. Ghantous made a motion to accept the minutes; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded. The minutes were approved with six affirmative votes and one abstention (Ramirez).

The minutes of the July 6, 2022 meeting were considered. Mrs. Ghantous made a motion to accept the minutes; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded. The minutes were approved with seven affirmative votes.

### Committee and Official Reports

#### Civil Service Commission

Mr. Coleman: Civil Service Commission did meet on July 7<sup>th</sup>, and all members were present, along with Mr. (Brian) Uhl, and Ms. (Stephanie) Morgan. There were several items of business. The first item was the Patrol Officer hiring process update. Happy to report that the selected candidate successfully completed the background investigation process and is expected to begin employment this month. As a matter of fact, Chris may have started. He will be starting on the 18<sup>th</sup>. Oh, today's the 20<sup>th</sup>, so he just started. Okay. In addition, a second candidate was also selected due to the resignation by one of the Lieutenants. So, again, that would bring two additional officers on board as we continue to keep up with the goings and comings, if you will, of the personnel. The second item was the custodian hiring process. And, am happy to report that interviews were conducted for one open position and a conditional offer has been made, and acceptance is pending. So, we know the folks down at the Rec Center are chomping at the bit to get a new custodian in there. The next item of business concerning the Firefighter II EMT and Firefighter II Paramedic and that hiring process. A request for the waiver of the written testing requirements for these positions was approved along with a timeline for new hiring process, and on Saturday, August 30<sup>th</sup>, we will be conducting the physical agility test for the Fire Department there at the Fairfield location. The last item that I have is additional requests to waive the testing requirement for a Police Clerk due to, again, a vacancy in that position, so the Commission agreed to that request and will waive the written test requirement and we did approve the timeline for the Police Clerk hiring process. That concludes my report. Any questions? (None) Thank you.

#### Rules and Laws

Mrs. Ghantous: Mr. Jacobs will report.

Mr. Jacobs: Rules and Laws met previous to this meeting. We approved the final language for the peer to peer car sharing regulations. That goes on to Planning (Commission). They will see that language and they'll weigh in on August 9<sup>th</sup>, and it will come back to us; so that's finally done. We had discussions about e-scooters. There are some local communities that have moved towards either bans or regulations on e-scooters. We didn't take any action. We're going to look further at that. We also talked about future consideration of regulations on Airbnb's. Other communities have made some decisions in those areas, so we had a conversation and we'll be touching those issues again when we meet on the 17<sup>th</sup> of August. Unless Mrs. Ghantous has anything else, that concludes my report.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

### Finance Committee

Mr. Hawkins: Finance Committee met today, July 20<sup>th</sup>. All members were in attendance. We had one matter of discussion which was the purchase of a new ambulance. Presentation was brought by Firehouse Assistant Chief Williams, as well as Mr. (John) Jones. And, I'll start at the end. The Finance Committee recommends the purchase of said vehicle. The purchase price would be \$355,426.42. There is the possibility for some variance in that with regard to the power cot that goes with it. The bottom line is the build out would take 20 to 24 months. We wouldn't have to pay anything until upon delivery, so it would be part of the 2024 Budget. We currently, for this year, did not have any rolling stock in our budget, so Administration came to us as a result of the Fire Department coming to them and that we're basically in significant need and preparation in looking ahead to make this happen. This would replace a 2006 ambulance that currently has over 120,000 miles on it. It's had a lot of work back and forth on that vehicle. The reality is the Finance Committee is going to recommend that we add this to the agenda today, and that we have it with an emergency clause. These prices are continuing to go up. They had a price increase at the beginning of this year of about \$10,000, and the reality is that by the end of this week, it's going to go up by another \$24,000. So, with the cost of aluminum and some other things, these prices are continuing to rise. So, we'll make that recommendation. We have Assistant Chief (Scott) Williams present if anybody has any questions with regard to this ambulance. I will say, and he's got all the great details, but I will say the thing that's significant with regard to this compared to the current ambulances that we have, is that they're moving to putting these boxes on the back on four chassis which will help us long-term fiscally from the standpoint that when the chassis goes bad, we can replace just the box, put it on to a new chassis, it's going to save a lot of money, considerably going forward. But, Assistant Chief (Scott) Williams, anything you'd like to add?

Assistant Chief Williams: Yes. So, thank you first of all for allowing us to be here tonight to share what we're trying to do here at the Firehouse and get this ambulance. So, one of the big advantages of going with this company is the boxes are made out of aluminum and they have seen a huge success with remounting the boxes on new chassis. So, with that, it's the same vehicle if we were to add it currently, if we'd remount that it would be about \$142,000 versus a \$355,000. Long term it's really going to benefit the City and the Fire Department and just really reduce those costs.

Mr. Hawkins: Any questions for Assistant Chief (Williams)?

Mr. Anderson: Just one question and it's probably for Finance (Committee) or Administration. Do we need to do anything since it's two years away. Is there anything we need to do in the Resolution to make it eligible to be used for TIF funds if those become available at the time that the payment is due? Do we have to do the resolution differently or is that a possibility?

Mr. Hawkins: We had some discussion with regard to that and Administration has indicated that Mr. Braun said retroactively if we're linking this directly to the project and go through and do that, I was going to suggest adding when it comes to that time for discussion with regard to the ordinance that we indicate that it's also believed that this is going to be useful with regard to a need for the development of the Artisan Village/Tri County Mall Redevelopment and we should be able to link that back.

Mr. Anderson: So, we'll need to add that language or is that the language that's going to be presented?

Mr. Hawkins: That's just the suggestion that I'm going to put into discussion when we come to that point.

Mr. Anderson: Okay. Thank you.

Mr. Ramirez: I will note too that the reason for the urgency is, as I understand, Mr. Williams, that this week is the deadline.

Assistant Chief Williams: Correct.

City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Ramirez: And as Lawrence (Hawkins) already stated, it's \$24,000 if we decide not to do it this week or today?

Assistant Chief Williams: Correct. If we don't order it by the end of this week, it's going to go up seven percent, which is about \$24,000. And then, we're going to get the same vehicle for that additional cost.

Mr. Ramirez: And that amounts to seven percent of the whole cost.

Assistant Chief Williams: The whole cost of the vehicle; yes.

Mr. Ramirez: And most likely there will be an increase. You said there was one in January already.

Assistant Chief Williams: One in January, now in July, so I'm sure there'll be more increases probably within the next six months.

Mr. Ramirez: So, if we fail to do something today, it'll certainly be more than seven percent.

Assistant Chief Williams: Yes.

Mr. Ramirez: Thank you.

Mayor Webster: I just have one comment. Well, it has no bearing on your decision I'm sure, but, just for historical perspective. I can remember when we used to buy squads for \$30,000 dollars. And now, we're asking you to spend \$355,000 for one squad. We could buy a fire truck for \$355,000 back then. But, that's days gone by.

Mr. Hawkins: Mr. President, with that, I make a motion to amend the agenda to add an ordinance with regard to the purchase of a new ambulance to this agenda.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Second.

President Vanover: Do you have the ordinance number?

Mrs. McNear: Twenty three.

President Vanover: Twenty three. Alright, we've had a motion and a second. Discussion on adding Ordinance No. 23-2022? (None)

Motion to amend the agenda to include Ordinance No. 23-2022 with regard to the purchase of a new ambulance passes with seven affirmative votes.

Mr. Hawkins: Thank you Assistant Chief (Williams).

Assistant Chief Williams: Thank you so much. Appreciate it.

Planning Commission

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup - No report

Board of Zoning Appeals

Mrs. Ghantous: Well, I'm sorry I walked off without my prepared report, so I'm going to kind of give you the "Reader's Digest" version. And then, Jeff (Anderson) is going to step in and give you all the details. So, BZA met on June 21<sup>st</sup>, and we had one applicant and that was Jake Sweeney. Representative for Jake Sweeney came to talk to us about moving a sign; an existing sign from their location on Northland (Boulevard), down to their new body shop collision repair by Mike's Car Wash on East Kemper (Road). So, they wanted to move the sign because it's a newly issued sign, it's attractive, and it was going to save them money to not have to buy a new sign. After much discussion, it was agreed that if they would mount the sign so that it was only eight feet above the grade, if you recall that property drops down,

City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mrs. Ghantous (continued): and the Commission, voted unanimously, excuse me, not unanimously, we had six “for” and one “against”, and what else? What did I forget?

Mr. Anderson: No, I think that was great. The Board felt that they substantially complied with the intent of the Zoning Code. By moving it back, there was a steep drop off in the grade. The Code allows for them to have an eight foot sign from grade. We just moved the point of measurement to the sidewalk which is where the visible line happens to start. So, the actual sign, they were able to reuse it, but, they do have to modify it. They’re taking a segment off, but yes, it ends up being about the same; they just had to push it back from the street so that it’s eight feet above. So, they have the same signage, visible signage as with Mike’s Car Wash up the street, and other people on that same road have, so we felt it was substantially compliant and it was approved.

Mrs. Ghantous: And that’s it unless you all have any questions.

Mr. Anderson: I would add one more thing if I could. We did actually have a discussion at the end of that meeting. Since we had that discussion in this meeting about how we interact with Planning (Commission), the Board also took some time in the discussion at the end of the meeting to talk about that. To figure out how we as a group, the Board of Zoning Appeals could be more intentional about asking questions about things that had come to Planning (Commission), so there’s some good discussion there. So, they heard that feedback and that was passed along too, so I wanted to share with Council that we heard that feedback and we’re trying to do more to be inclusive of those comments as best as we can. Thank you.

Board of Health

Mr. Jacobs: We are still on hiatus. I did hear from the (Health) Commissioner. He just wanted to remind folks that, and it’s just anecdotal, but, if you work in an office or something like that, you might notice there’s an uptick in COVID infections. The Commissioner basically, although he hasn’t changed any recommendations, we’re giving vaccinations every Thursday from 9:00 a.m. until 12:45 p.m., I think more than 100 vaccines were given out last month just here in Springdale. But, the recommendation is still if you’re over 50 and have any complications, just make sure you’re current; whether that be a booster, or the initial vaccines for those folks. And that concludes anything I have. Thank you.

Capital Improvements	Mrs. Ghantous	-	No report
O-K-I	Mr. Anderson	-	No report

Mayor’s Report

Mayor Webster: The only thing I want to talk about is that I’m sure you’ve all seen and hear on the news where Costco has once again decided they’re going to close their store, so it’s quite unfortunate. We thought we had that salvaged, but it turned out it didn’t happen. I’d just like to make a couple of comments about that. First off, at the last engagement session down at the Community Center, I had a fellow stand up and make some comment about why you don’t tell us this, or so on, and so on; you’re not being transparent. Well, it’s one of those situations where you’re “damned if we do, and damned if we don’t.” And, that’s exactly what I told this young man down there, and I think this is the perfect example. Sometime, I’m not sure, I don’t have the dates at my fingertips, but, April or May, our Building Department got word that they were going to convert that current Springdale store to a business center. It would be temporarily closed while they made the different renovations, and then, once it reopened, it most likely be a business center. Well, that was very exciting news I thought because a lot of people in this City patronize Costco, and a lot of people were upset because it was going to close, so I thought, I didn’t really have any second thoughts about sharing that news with the public. And, I have a copy of the minutes right here. I did share that with the public. Well, now, they changed their mind again, and decided they’re going to close it down. So, it gets back to “damned if you do, and damned if you don’t”, so I’m sorry if I got people’s hopes up, but that’s the way it goes. We can’t control what businesses do. Businesses come, businesses go, and the City can’t make them stay, and they can’t make them go for that matter, not that we’d want them to. I know Andy (Kuchta) has had several conversations with the real estate people regarding Costco, so, do you have anything that you’d want to add Andy (Kuchta)? Any other questions?

City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Kuchta: Sure. Thank you Mayor. Just briefly, I've already had two inquiries from two commercial brokers in the Cincinnati area with potential tenants for that space, so, I'm cautiously optimistic it is not going to stay vacant for very long. It's probably going to be different uses. Probably not going to be retail. I cannot imagine any retail user going back into that space. Big box retailers are just not doing that these days very much; certainly not much in markets where there's not or hasn't been a crazy amount of growth. Like some parts of the country, the Austin's, the parts of Florida, and around Atlanta where there's just been year over year double digit percentage growth of new homes; yes, you're going to see more of these big box openings in those areas to service where those residents have gone, and are going, but, this general market, not just Springdale, but, the communities all around us have been built out for a long time, so, we don't have that kind of growth. I do not see a mainline, big box user coming back. It's either going to be light manufacturing, warehousing distribution, or potentially somebody buying it to redevelop in some other way, but, based on the inquiries that we're already getting, I think it's going to be a reuse of the building, which is good news.

Mayor Webster: That's all I have unless someone's got questions.

Clerk of Council/Finance Director

Mrs. McNear: The General Fund update through June 30, 2022 for receipts, based on a net receipt budget of \$21.218 million dollars. We have received \$13.618 million dollars, which is 66% of the budget. The fund resources are from Earnings Tax, Real Estate Taxes, Paramedic Services, Local Government Funds, and Mayor's Court for the top five reasons, and that is a total of \$12.677 million dollars, which is 93% of all of our receipts. For expenditures through June 30<sup>th</sup>, based on a net expenditure budget of \$21.349 million dollars, we have spent \$10.374 million dollars, which is 48% of the budget. Our General Fund ending balance through June 30, 2022 is \$8.644 million dollars and that concludes my report. Thank you.

Administrator's Report

Mr. Jones: I've got a few things this evening. First, from Director (Charlie) Wilson of Parks and Rec. July is Parks and Rec Month. They will be having Art in the Park prior to the concert that's coming up that I'll talk about briefly in a second. They'll have in excess of 30 pieces of art that will be displayed leading up to that concert on Thursday. That will be The Remains; classic rock and modern hits, starting at 7:30 p.m. and, again, that's Thursday, July 21<sup>st</sup>. Teen Pool Party Friday, July 22<sup>nd</sup>, 8:00 p.m. until 10:00 p.m.; that's for fifth through eighth graders. The Goldfish Swim will take place Sunday, August 7<sup>th</sup> at 1:00 p.m. Last day of regular open swim at the pool this year is, for fully opened is August 6<sup>th</sup>. A few positions that are open currently, part-time is Fitness Instructor Community Center, Part-time Maintenance Worker, both Parks and Public Works seasonal maintenance workers both Parks and Public Works, Part-Time Teen Adviser, Community Center, Part-Time Customer Service representative, Community Center, and, finally, Part-Time Facilities Maintenance Worker at the Community Center. That's all this evening. Thank you.

Law Director's Report

Mr. Braun

-

No report

Engineer's Report

Mr. Riggs: We'll start with the Community Center Re-Roofing Phase II; so that project is complete. We had a closeout meeting on July 1<sup>st</sup>, and the Certificate of Substantial Completion was issued on July 5<sup>th</sup>. So, this can be removed from our list. Northland Boulevard Reconstruction Project; we're authorized to begin work on the shared-use path analysis for the northern shelter. We're going to do some field survey and we're expected to complete the field survey by the end of August. There was with the change or the possible change in the project scope the construction schedule has been shifted from the first quarter of 2024 to the fourth quarter of 2024. So, our plan submittal date is moved back from July to actually October 7<sup>th</sup> of this year, so that will be our Stage II, three plan submittal to ODOT (Ohio Department of Transportation). The (Route) 747 Curb and Catch Basin Repair Project; that project is substantially complete. We still have to go through the project closeout procedures on that one. And, the State Route 747 Urban Paving Project; draft final plans were submitted to Public Works for review on July 7<sup>th</sup>, and final plans are expected to be submitted to ODOT by the end of this month. That's all I have.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

### Communications

Mrs. McNear: Yes Mr. President I do have one item. I received an email from Daniel Messer on July 12<sup>th</sup> and the subject is "Follow up to Council Meeting on July 6<sup>th</sup>". It states:

*"Hello Kathy,*

*I am writing to further clarify my thoughts from the last Council meeting. My original presentation is attached. Please distribute this to Council. To be clear, I am not against expansion and the welcoming of new residents. I am concerned about tailoring the City to new, largely short-term residents versus what I see as the current base including some renters and many homeowners and many families, both young and older. I believe that the relocation of our Community Center should be kept at the current base at the heart of its services. When I attended the Community Center Relocation Info Meeting on April 12<sup>th</sup>, 2022, it felt like a sales pitch meeting that emphasized all potential benefits to current residents without admitting any potential downsides. I thought that the meeting lacked two significant acknowledgements. One, the new residents, particularly those will move into the mall redevelopment, will likely feel entitled to priority use of a facility that is both at their location and either part of their rental agreement and were used as a draw to sell premium-priced apartments. Two, the new mall residents, and perhaps other new residents will likely be sold on the use of a wonderful new facility, which will naturally over-represent their numbers. If I understand it now, we have ten to fifteen percent of our residents using the SCC, but the numbers of the new residents likely to be members is almost certain to be in very high numbers. Between these higher percentages, it will likely increase interest of current residents. We will easily double our numbers. The new facility was sold to us current residents in terms of enjoying it with our current numbers while the reality is that we will be sharing it with a much larger membership. Although the fitness center may be adequate expansion, I question whether the pool or gyms could possibly suffice in this realistic scenario. I recommend we put TIF funds back into the existing Springdale Community Center so that our community will retain its center. As a side note, I will be willing to donate some hours to look at potential solutions toward the longevity of the current facility. Based on having some commercial maintenance experience as a general contractor, the numbers for short-term capital expenses seems exaggerated."*

That completes the email. I did send a copy of this to all of the people on the dais, and if anyone else would like to see this, it will be on file in my office. That concludes Communications.

Mr. Ramirez: I thought I'd address the comment about the TIF funds because this keeps coming up, and, TIF funds cannot be used for the current Community Center. It can only be used for enhancements of a new center, which they had proposed over at the Tri County Mall. We cannot use the TIF funds at our current facility to repair the pool, repair our leaky roof, put new air conditioners in. So, I just thought I'd bring that forward. Thank you.

Mr. Anderson: I agree with that comment. The TIF funds directly can't be used. I think it is something worth investigating though, and it's something I know we're doing, generally speaking, is money that can be used for the TIF fund currently exists in our General Budget, right? So, we buy rolling stock, for example, an ambulance for \$350,000 without the TIF fund, that would come out of our general funds, and has been for the past 20 to 30 years. With the addition of TIF funds, money that was previously budgeted for those types of capital improvements can be used there. That frees up budget money that could be used on the current Community Center. So, I agree, what you said is exactly true for what Mr. Messer said. But, I think it's probably just a nuance question is there is money that would be available that's freed up by the TIF, even if the TIF money isn't directly being used. So, I think it is a fair question, something that we can explore as we go down this exploration that we're still doing. Thank you.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

### Communications from the Audience

Ms. Chapman: Hi. Do I need to write myself on here? Um, what day is today? Seven twenty something. Hi, I'm a new resident. I just moved in here in April and I'm...

President Vanover: State your name please.

Ms. Chapman: Sorry, my name is Megan Chapman.

President Vanover: And your address.

Ms. Chapman: I'm new to this whole situation.

President Vanover: Okay. That's fine.

Ms. Chapman: I'll write myself down here. This is like the first time that I've been here to be able to weigh in on the new Community Center and all of that. I mean, I agree wholeheartedly with the gentleman that emailed in that the Community is centered around this area. It's not centered around where the Tri-County Mall is, and it would be unfortunate to lose that proximity to the families that are there. If you have people coming in in rental agreements, you're not getting the families that are established in your community. You're getting temporary residents and it's just not necessarily going to be like who you're supposed to serve. Sorry, I'm trying to write this down and talk at the same time and I'm not good at this. Like, my kids were on the swim team this year, and we love the Community Center area. I haven't had the opportunity to join yet, but we definitely plan on doing so in the future to take advantage of all of the sports and everything. And, it's just, it would be a shame to move it farther away, especially in a more "trafficky" area where most people, if they're trying to walk there, or whatever, they're not going to be able to walk; they're going to have to drive. So, there's also the consideration that you'll need to have more parking for the people that are there, and all of that. Like, right now, there is like, we could technically walk from where we live, but if it moves, there's no way I'm going to have my three children crossing (Route) 747. It just is what it is. And, as a result of that, we may not utilize the Community Center as much as we would have had it stayed where it is. And, then, I'm really sad about Costco moving. That is all.

President Vanover: What is your address?

Ms. Chapman: I'm 479 Vista Glen Drive.

President Vanover: Alright. Thank you.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I just had a question really quick for you. You just moved here in April, and you feel that this is the center of the City. We have a whole other side of the City over in Heritage Hill that has been very ignored for a very long time as far as our facilities.

Ms. Chapman: Where is Heritage Hill at?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Heritage Hill is on the other side of..

Ms. Chapman: On the other side of Route 4?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Yes. It's over like Crescentville Road, and things like that. So, the thing that I had heard a lot of from the people in Heritage Hill was how excited they were that we were finally moving a lot of our recreation things over there.

Ms. Chapman: Okay.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Because a lot of those families haven't had very much access to here. I do absolutely hear, because I live right back here in this neighborhood and it's always been nice to walk. It's great, but, I do feel bad because other places don't have the same access. It's hard. It's hard to balance it because someone is going to be mad no matter what we do.

Ms. Chapman: Yes.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I want everybody to understand that. No matter if everybody says, "Yes", or everybody says, "No". Someone is going to be mad. And that's just the reality of it. As far as the City center, I was excited about this one for proximity because it would actually be the center of Springdale to bring both sides together. I just wanted to clarify that because I know you said you just moved here in April. I didn't know if you even knew about Heritage Hill over there that they are a part of Springdale.

Ms. Chapman: I've heard of that, but I didn't know exactly where it was.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Growing up it was really hard. A lot of my friends lived over in Heritage Hill. Mr. Vanover lives over in Heritage Hill. I know that Mr. Anderson is from Heritage Hill. It's a haul from there to here if you're talking about walking, they couldn't necessarily walk, and things like that. So, that was, in my opinion, that was kind of a bonus when I saw that it was moving was that it was actually going to be, in my head, it was more inclusive to both sides of Springdale. That was just my take on it, but, again, thank you for your comments and everything.

Ms. Chapman: I mean like if it was on like the one side of Springdale where like, not Springdale, but (Route) 747 Princeton Glendale like where you didn't actually have to cross over like a million lanes of traffic.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I agree.

Ms. Chapman: That'd be one thing, but.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: We are working on different ideas and pathways and things like that. There are definitely some connectivity things that are being worked on and thought of and processed through right now to try and make...

Ms. Chapman: Because Kemper and Princeton Glendale are so busy, like, I, like as a grownup, like I don't even feel comfortable walking across that myself, I'm like, uh.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: And that is being looked at and that has been something that...

Ms. Chapman: Like pedestrian bridges or something like that.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Just footbridges, or connectivity things, things like that. All things are being looked at and we don't have anything finalized, but, it's all being looked at and being considered because safety is absolutely a priority with all of us. Thank you so much for coming.

Ms. Chapman: Thank you.

Mr. Jacobs: Welcome to Springdale. I'm a transplant as well, so, welcome to the City. And I also appreciate you coming up and speaking, I know it's not easy. I want to thank you for expressing your viewpoints. I also want to thank Mr. Messer for following up. We need more residents to express their views. I think all of us are struggling with the difficult tradeoffs that you're talking about. It's not just about proximity for people in District One or Two. We have a dedicated City campus versus something that has more of a commercial feel. And, we're thinking about all of those issues. But, again, thanks for expressing your viewpoints for us.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Anderson: I was going to say similar things. I appreciate you coming tonight. It's not easy to come up to the dais and it's not easy to come up there and talk, so I appreciate you taking the time to do that. And, likewise, Mr. Messer following up. Those type of comments are always welcome. They're certainly things that we've looked at. The traffic was something that was brought up in the engagement sessions that Mr. Messer mentioned too. And, as Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup said, that's being looked at. But, more than just it's being looked at, understand there's actually a shared path multi-use path trail master plan that's being developed and there's a timeline for that. So, I think it may be next meeting we can get an update on the progress for how that's going. I know there's some dates coming up in the next few weeks for it, but, there's an opportunity to give feedback to that plan too to make sure that some of these tough routes are covered. I share the eight lengths of traffic on (Route) 747 terrifies me and our kids, like, we ride our bikes from the Rec Center from Oxford Hills on the other side of town. I grew up in Heritage Hill, so, I know what it feels like to be on both sides of the tracks. I'm not sure which one is the good side or the bad side yet, but it is something that we're looking at. So, anyway, I wanted to say thank you for coming out. I know it's tough to stand up there and talk to us, but don't feel discouraged. I think everyone should do that. Anyone that has a feeling or opinion is welcome to reach to any of us, and share those. Because I'm sure there's things that we're missing. As Mr. Jacobs said, this is a tough decision for a lot of us because it's a big change. If it moves, it's a big deal. If it doesn't move, there's a lot of work that we have to figure out to shore up the existing buildings. So, there's a lot going on there. So, thank you for coming out, but, hopefully that mixed use plan we can get an update on and maybe that will help too.

Mr. Hawkins: Echoing, Ms. Chapman, thank you for coming out and giving your input and thank you Mr. Messer again for his comments last meeting as well as the email from tonight. There's a lot of input that's come from folks and it's important for folks to give input and continue to give input. And, Mr. Messer had said the first meeting on April 12<sup>th</sup> sounded like a sales pitch. And, I had heard that from several residents. And, it's important for the situation not to be misconstrued though from the standpoint that the City Administration, Council, are only looking to what are positives. The reality is since December/January the primary focus has been on what are all these negatives and how are we going to deal with things if they go the wrong direction. How are we going to manage those things? A giant group of "what-ifs". And so, you know, the good part I can tell you is early on in some of the discussions and community involvement, some of the things that residents have said is that there have been some things that had been new to my ears that I hadn't thought about or hadn't heard. At this point, I really haven't heard something new that the Administration has not been looking at, or contemplating in terms of problems. Now, you're not going to see or hear everything that Administration is going to go through in terms of their process to go through, but, I would say this to the public; I do feel confident from the standpoint that all of those things that may go wrong, or potential problems, or negatives, are under consideration. I still encourage any and all residents, people, businesses. You have input? Please come bring it. Because you never know you may uncover the one rock that maybe hasn't been thought about or talked about. But, I'm telling you right now, folks are grinding and digging through all of those options and potential problems that there are and talk and discussion as Mr. Anderson said, hey, well if we stayed here, what's the difference if we use those TIF dollars for other things and use more money in our General Fund to use toward the Rec Center or something like that. All of these things are being talked about and discussed, so, nobody should feel as though hey the Administration or Council is just living in la la land from the standpoint; let's just be positive with regard to what's going to happen with this development and let's jump all in. That's not what's been going on. Everything has been a discussion and thought process on what if this goes wrong, or what if that goes wrong, or how do we deal with this, or how do we deal with staffing, how do we deal with people being in two different locations if we move over there. These are all things that are going on. These are all things that are being thought about and so, Administration, members of Council, Elected Officials, folks are being very diligent in this process. And, I don't know where the end result is going to be. I don't know where the end vote is going to be for myself, much less everybody up here, but, folks should rest assure that people are taking this situation very seriously and going through and thinking about it. The last thing I'll say on this is you know, we're talking about the actual location and longitude and latitude of the Rec Center. If you live close to the Rec Center, and there are few people that live closer to the Rec Center than I did growing up because I lived in Wimbledon Apartments, I could cross the street, and I'm there. And, that

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Hawkins (continued): was wonderful. If your issue is going to be the longitude and latitude, you're just not going to be happy if it moves. That's the reality of it. And, I understand that. There's an amount of comfort and easy access that folks are used to. But, the decision that I'm going to make when I vote, and I think folks up here are going to make when they vote is what's the best thing for the City, for today, and for the next 10, 15, 20 years from now. And, you know, if I can't ride my bike there, I can't cross the street, there, I can't walk there, that maybe I may have to do something different for me, but I'm going to make a decision on what I think is best for the City. There's a reality that we have been westward focused in the City of Springdale for decades. Most people live west of (Route) 747. Most people live west of Value City, right? Most people live over here. I grew up with Thriftway over here, and despite several different grocery stores or places where you could buy produce that are east of (Route) 747, people are like, "Well, we don't have a grocery store." It's like, well, there are three different places you can go buy produce. But, it's not the same things; it's not what we're used to. So, as things evolve, we may have to change our mindsets with regard to how things are. That's not necessarily going to be a bad thing. We've got to look at the entire situation, but we shouldn't be wrapped up just in the longitude or latitude of where the Rec Center is. It is important to look at that, but, it's also really important to look at all the other things that factor into it. And, the primary thing that, I think it's safe to say that City Administration and Elected Officials are looking at is it's not a rec center for just the new residents; it's for everybody. And, there's a decision that's being made for everybody involved. Thank you Mr. President.

Mr. Wisecup: Ian Wisecup; 152 Silverwood Circle. The Heritage Hill point had been made. I was going to make it, but, also, we're not completely uprooting everything from the site where we have like our community center now to there. I imagine we'll still get use out of the big concrete area there, the fields. I imagine the ComeUnity Bash may or may not still be hosted there and the Mud Quest and all that, so we're not completely abandoning that site. We're not completely saying there's going to be just parks over there from now on and that's it. That's just something to keep in mind.

President Vanover: We have another resolution, or we have a resolution to add to the agenda. Mr. Braun if you would. This will be Resolution No. R15-2022, so I need a motion to add.

Mr. Braun: This is a resolution that I was asked by Mr. Vanover to prepare. It's a draft resolution and if Council wants to add it to the agenda, it is "A Resolution Adopting a Policy for the City of Springdale, Ohio Relating to Elected Officials Regarding E-Mail Communications".

President Vanover: I need a motion to add Resolution No. R15-2022 to the agenda.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I'd like to make a motion to add Resolution No. R15-2022 to the agenda.

Mrs. Ghantous: I'll second that.

President Vanover: We'll hold discussion until we get to the thing.

Mr. Anderson: This is discussion on whether we should add it or not. That's why I was paging it now. Is there a reason that we're adding it to the agenda in the meeting as opposed to just saving this for next time so we have a chance to review it?

President Vanover: Well, part of the issue is that the next Council meeting we will be short two Council members, and if it would roll there, they don't get their chance to speak in, and with the increased number of records requests, we need to address this policy as we have stated in the past. We talked for a long period of time at the last meeting, and I didn't say that we would call the question.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Anderson: I understand, just not having the resolution before the meeting is why I'm struggling, because to review the policy and be able to act on it tonight, it seems like a bigger ask than it seems. Why wouldn't we wait for the following meeting where there is a full Council then? I mean, obviously, we can vote on it, but, I would rather have a chance to review the policy instead of reading it at the dais and voting on it.

President Vanover: Mr. Braun had taken the time to do research and I pressed him to get that complete. So, I wanted a full complement of Council members here when it came forward.

Mr. Hawkins: I appreciate the prior discussion at the last meeting. I appreciate the efforts to put this together quickly. I would like to have a little bit more time on it. I understand that the idea of wanting to move forward with it with regard to some of the increased records requests that are coming through. But, if I had my druthers, I'd probably rather have it set into August just to have the ability to go through and do it; yes the second meeting of August. That's just my two cents.

President Vanover: Well, we've got a motion and second. Is there any other (discussion)? (None)

Motion to add Resolution No. R15-2022 to the agenda passes with four affirmative votes and three opposing votes (Anderson, Hawkins, and Jacobs).

### Ordinances and Resolutions

#### Ordinance No. 22-2022

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING CONTRIBUTIONS TO CERTAIN HEALTH ACCOUNTS OF FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES OF THE CITY OF SPRINGDALE RELATED TO THE CITY'S HEALTH INSURANCE PLAN AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY

Mrs. Ghantous made a motion to adopt Ordinance No. 22-2022; Mr. Hawkins seconded.

Ordinance No. 22-2022 passes with seven affirmative votes.

#### Ordinance No. 23-2022

AN ORDINANCE ACCEPTING A PROPOSAL UNDER THE STATE OF OHIO COOPERATIVE PURCHASING PROGRAM AND AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CLERK OF COUNCIL/FINANCE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH HORTON EMERGENCY VEHICLES IN THE AMOUNT OF \$355,427 FOR THE PURCHASE OF A NEW AMBULANCE AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY

Mr. Hawkins made a motion to adopt Ordinance No. 23-2022; Mrs. Ghantous seconded.

Ordinance No. 23-2022 passes with seven affirmative votes.

Mr. Jacobs: Just a quick clarification that Mr. Hawkins mentioned. We'll actually make this payment up to two years from now? Okay. That's all. Thank you.

Mr. Jones: That's actually what I was going to address. If we were in a situation where we had to do it this year, we would have not ordered it because we would not be making arrangements to pay for it. So, because of the fact that we don't have to address that until 2024, and we'll decide at that time how we'll pay for it. Whether we'll be taking out a three payment plan, or paying in full, or whatever we'll do at that time. It's a great opportunity for our Fire Department. They'll be excited. I think Mr. Hawkins articulated that it was a 2006 that it is replacing. We've had several problems in the last few months. We just put \$25,000 work in one of our ambulances, and you know, you've got to do it; you've got to have it, and you can get a loaner temporarily, but there's no rental program out there that you can go and rent it and hang on to it for several months so, I know our Fire Department is very appreciative. Our Assistant Chief Williams and several staff members worked extremely hard on this to get it "spec'd" and detailed out, and I know they would appreciate your support this evening. Thank you.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Hawkins: I want to note for the record that this ambulance will be necessary and useful regarding the new development at Tri County Mall/Artisan Village. This ambulance will help service that new development. This is in anticipation of serving our current residents that will be using that site, patronizing restaurants, stores, what have you, as well as new residents that will be living on that site.

Mr. Ramirez: Question for Mr. Hawkins. As I understand it, they were not the lowest bidder, but they were the best bidder for the requirements that we had.

Mr. Hawkins: That's accurate. They were the best bidder. It's the best piece of equipment that's going to be the most useful for our Fire Department. There are several other fire departments that have used and have purchased recently this model of ambulance and this box. So, it's our recommendation, based on the information we have. The best opportunity for us.

Mr. Ramirez: I just wanted to make sure that there was another company lower, but that it didn't meet the requirements. So, this was the best move. Thank you.

Mayor Webster: Based on the current numbers, if we pay for this and purchase it like we have the ones in the past, we'll pay a third of that in three consecutive years. So, the first payment is not due until 2024, and so, we should get the first TIF revenue in 2025, so, that would mean that the first payment of \$120,000 approximately, would have to come out of the City coffers, but then the subsequent two payments should be serviced by TIF revenue. It's like getting a new ambulance for \$120,000; it brings back the good old days.

Mr. Anderson: I hope when the time comes that the ambulance is delivered that maybe we have an opportunity to have a community contest to name the ambulance and maybe paint a little name on it and maybe get people excited about it. Something to think about when they have the Fire Department Open House. Maybe we can drop that in there.

President Vanover: I'm sure they'll be excited about it when it pulls up in their driveway.

Ordinance No. 23-2022 passes with seven affirmative votes.

### Resolution No. R15-2022

A RESOLUTION ADOPTING A POLICY FOR THE CITY OF SPRINGDALE, OHIO RELATING TO ELECTED OFFICIALS REGARDING E-MAIL COMMUNICATIONS

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup made a motion to adopt Resolution No. R15-2022; Mr. Ramirez seconded.

Mr. Jacobs: I feel this is really rushed. That's one of the reasons that I voted no. I could have gotten this as an email, speaking of email, before I got here tonight. I have tons of questions about it. I don't understand the need for it. I'd like to hear that we've had a problem, that some email has not been produced to require a policy like this. I haven't heard that happening. I don't know of any records that have been withheld to justify a policy change like this. It seems like a solution in search of a problem. For example, what if, a question I have, let's say I have a friend who's a constituent before I ran for this seat. And then, I am elected to this seat. That friend reaches out to me with a question about Council. Based on this policy, I have to tell them, "I can't respond to this email, you have to reach me at my other address". And again, for that policy to go into effect, I need to see a reason for it, and, I don't know what the reason is for this. I also don't know what happens if I violate this policy. There's nothing in here about that. Just as a member of Council, I wouldn't like to be told how to communicate with my constituents. That's my first reaction. I'm open to hearing some rationale if records have been withheld to justify this. Otherwise, I'm kind of in the dark and surprised.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Braun: I was asked to prepare the legislation and I have some of the answers to the questions by Mr. Jacobs, but I did want to address what happens if a resident messages you from a foreign email account because I think that could very realistically happen under this policy, and the answer is you're the one that's subject to the policy; not the resident. So, you would comply with the policy by simply answering their email from your official City account. That's how you would have to do it. The burden isn't on them. If they happen to know you're personal email account, or some other means that they can message you, they certainly entitled to do that, but your response, because you're the only one subject to the policy, would be to respond using the official City email. Your other question was what happens if someone violates the policy. That's a very good question. I remind all the elected officials that I serve as counsel for that Council governs itself. So, I think the answer to your policy is the people sitting up here decide what happens in the event of a violation and that's backed up by our Charter, and our ordinances. So, you decide what happens if there's a policy violation. The policy doesn't address it; you as a body do. One other thing I think when Mr. Vanover talked to me, and obviously we had a healthy discussion at the last meeting as well about this, and this is an issue that comes up constantly for municipalities and attorneys is this is a best practice. That's what this is. It promotes efficiency, and obviously, it promotes the highest level of transparency that you can have for the public. The City is obligated to comply with Revised Code 149.43, and the best way to ensure that the City has access to those communications by elected officials is to use a server that the City can search, that the City can obviously obtain emails from. We already require this for all of our City staff. So, what we're essentially doing in a policy like this is making the same rule that applies to City staff, apply to elected officials. And, again, it's not only a best practice, but it's an easy practice because when a record request comes in, the burden falls on the elected officials to manually scan through all of your records and try to make sure they're all in one space. To Mr. Jacobs' point, if you have friends that email you at five different email accounts, it's very difficult to search through all those accounts. It puts a burden on you as an elected official to do, and make sure that you have all of those. If what you advertise on the website, what the City is giving people is your official City email, what will happen in a very short period of time is people are creatures of habit. They will communicate with you in your City email. But I agree, Mr. Jacobs, there are opportunities where friends may know another way to reach out to you, and, again, the policy isn't for them. The policy is for you as elected officials. So you could simply respond. The other thing that I would point out is obviously there's a liability to the City if a record is not produced. We have been getting more record requests, which I should point out, and there are communities I represent that get a significant more number of record requests than Springdale does. But, it takes the burden off of elected officials, and we have a professional staff who are skilled in how to search those emails through key terms. They have programs that will search those and it's not something they would do absent a request to do so. I think if a staff member were using their knowledge to somehow look at records that they otherwise shouldn't, obviously, again, that's something that Administration could take up. Mr. Jones could discipline if he wanted. But, the key here is for the public. It does promote transparency for them. It makes sure that we get as many records as we possibly can and hopefully, all records when we get a record request in. If they're all kept in one centralized place, obviously, we know we can do that. I will point out this is a topic that has been heavily debated and discussed by local governments all across the region. Most of them deal with it by simply when an individual is elected as a new Council member, they instruct them in their new Council member training, "You have to use the City email address", and they do so. I would be deceiving you if I didn't say there are veteran elected officials in some communities who have said, "No, I don't want to do that", and there's two ways you can address that. One, I guess you can trust them that they're going to give you all the records when a request comes in, or two, you can adopt a policy like this. So, I will stop my speech where I started, which is that you govern yourself. I've explained to you the legal and practical reasons why a policy like this is a best practice, but, ultimately, it's up to the elected officials. I would also point out that this doesn't just apply to Council, but it applies to all elected officials, so it would apply to the Mayor, and Mrs. McNear as well. I think that's all the elected officials. So, everyone. Thank you.

President Vanover: Mr. Jones would you give us your take on the issue.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Jones: Sure. Thank you Mr. President. On behalf of Administration, we do get a lot of records requests. And, it's not overwhelming, but we get them. We need a certainty that we're providing those records. I don't want to put my name on something and send it to Joe Public who made a public records request and then I sign off saying I provided you anything and everything. If I don't know that to be accurate, I don't want to do that. So, I think it does a few things. It exposes personal liability for the individual because there's no guarantees that all the records have been provided. No disrespect Mr. Braun, but, for those communities that you're doing that in and they're asking you to trust them, I don't think that's a safe mechanism. I don't think it's the right way to do it. It's not transparent, and we've witnessed throughout the country at the highest level of lack of transparency and misuse of emails. So, I respectfully disagree with that approach, not that you agreed with it. I've been in this business since 1985; state and city government. I've worked for three cities. I've never known a jurisdiction nor the employer I worked for to use private emails to conduct state or city business. And, you know, I'm not an expert, but, I do think it's the most transparent, it's the easiest way to track things. It's efficient. I can go to my IT administrator and say, "Here's what we're looking for. I need all correspondence between Mr. Uhl and Mrs. Ghantous, and I need it within a reasonable period of time." And he can print those or send me an email immediately. I can't assure Mr. Braun or sign off on something that doesn't exist, or that I need to take somebody's word for that it was conducted that way. So, for tracking purposes, efficiency of operating our business, keeping people out of personal liability, you know, if we provide records and we're doing our City issued account, then, we're protected. If it's not through the City, you're exposing yourself. I just really think that it's a much better way to conduct business. We hired Mr. Braun for a reason. Actually, when I say, that, I mean Council did. If he's recommending that we do this, I think we should support that. Thank you.

Mrs. Ghantous: After the last meeting, I had the opportunity to talk to Mr. Uhl at great length about the topic and he explained to me why the Law Director is recommending this. It just made sense to me. It reduces my own personal liability, and the City's liability. So, I got set up, and I will be complying.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I went to the number one expert that I've ever known in the tech world. My husband has been working in IT technology. He's a computer engineer, he's been in a company for over 22 years. He's in charge of all their security and things like that making sure that everything is confidential and all that kind of crap and he does everything with computers. I made it sound really luxurious, but I had him, after the last meeting, type out some things to help me understand why this would be a good policy or whatever. He said it makes it easier to fulfill any records request. The onus is on the Administration and that handles the requests if any are missed, on the individual email, whose records have been requested, should be less likely to be personally liable, which I really appreciate. I don't want anybody to come and confiscate my computer if somebody thinks that I didn't comply with everything, which can happen. Better optics for being open, honest, and overall transparency when records are provided. Protecting yourself from the accusation of withholding information. If anything is actually subpoenaed, it minimizes the mixing of personal and professional assets and property and information. And, I had heard that there is concern about if somebody sends me an email, how do they know that the City isn't reading it? If someone sends me an email, it's a public record. So, if anybody wanted to read it, they're allowed to. They don't have to ask my permission; they can literally do a records request and get all of my City emails. So, if someone does send me an email, it's not guaranteed, and if I send them an email back, it's not guaranteed that nobody will see that. I don't think that Anthony is going to sit back there and sift through my emails. I think that's against the rules, but, it is a public record when there's an exchange of information between myself and someone else. And, I was asking about the security issue of it all, the servers and things like that because that is a concern, I wanted to make sure that everything is safe and whatever, and my husband, after talking through things with him, he was like, "It doesn't sound like it's really a technical issue that we're even worried about. What we're talking about here is transparency and a policy, so, it really wouldn't matter about the server, or things like that as much as it does having the information in one place that's easily accessible, and easily available when people do do a records request for the transparency." And, so, in my personal opinion, and why I was, before I even knew this was happening, was planning on supporting something like this was because in my mind, I would want to be as honest, open, and transparent that we can with everybody. I thought that's what we've been asked for all along and I would say complying with this is doing exactly what everyone's already asked us to do in the City which is

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup (continued): to be more honest and transparent, and open. So, that's why I will be supporting this. Thank you.

Mr. Jacobs: So, just to clarify, there hasn't been, in the recent spate of requests, have we lacked transparency? Can we document any lack of transparency? Has there been an email that wasn't produced that would have been if we had this policy?

Mr. Braun: I don't know the answer to that. Because...

Mr. Jacobs: The reason I ask, if I may, is because I didn't see this resolution until it was put right in front of me there seems to be an urgency here and I'm not understanding the urgency, which was my first concern. I use the City email. I have no desire to lack any transparency with anyone. But, again, I don't know what the problem is that lead to this. I hear perception problem, I hear efficiency, but I'm not hearing an actual problem that has led to this, and it seems rushed. And that's my number one concern. My second concern, like I said, I use the City email. I have since I took this seat. But, for the City to dictate that without an actual example causes me some concern, and I'm confused as to why this is so urgent for tonight. I did hear that within a month or so we may not be able to have all members present. I understand that, but, this still seems very rushed without an instigating factor. There's not an example where the City has been transparent that I've been told about and I would think that would be called for, for something like this.

Mr. Anderson: I think it's great that the City provides an option for City email. I know when I first started my first term five years ago, it actually wasn't set up for me until, or wasn't even offered until about a year into my term. I had to go investigate that. At the time I had a number of questions about the technology that was being used because it was less accessible, less useful than what I was using in the first year in my office. So, there were a number of technical questions that, I mean, we can go through tonight if you want. It seems urgent that we can go through them, or, if we want it tabled and talk about that with Anthony, we can do that too. But, if you want, I can go through some of those questions that I asked four and a half years ago when I opted not to use City email. Did you want to do that tonight, or would you rather wait? And, before you answer that, I do want to make sure that I understand the last part of this policy. In the past, the City had offered to forward email from the City address, and I think a number of people took advantage of that where they had a City email address, and then it would auto-forward to a personal address. This policy also bars that as an option going forward. I wanted to make sure people see that. So, the forwarding that was happening in the past is no longer an option under this policy. There's also not a timeline or a timeframe for the limitation, so right now, I'm on a number of mailing groups and lists from the County, the State, and the National government as a result of the COVID work I was doing over the past few years, HHS (Department of Health and Human Services), the Emergency Management Team of Hamilton County, they all have my other addresses. I still use that address for everything and they have it as part of their policy and logins and things like that. There's no timeframe for limitations, so that's going to be very challenging. If this does get adopted for me, I won't be in compliance for some time even if it was adopted, it's going to take time, so, I need to make sure that people are comfortable with that. Did you want to go through the technical questions tonight or do you want to do that offline?

President Vanover: Administration?

Mr. Uhl: Mr. Anderson, I don't know that we'll have all the answers because I'm sure you're going to take a deep dive on some of the questions, just based on your history, which is, I get it. So, I think some of the questions that you're going to have, if you could send them to Administration, we'll be happy to get some of those answers for you, and I'm not even sure that Anthony can necessarily answer those, but, NextStep, who is our third party administrator for our network will be able to answer all of those questions as they pertain to the actual server, and redundancies and backups, and whatnot.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Anderson: I'm happy to be a nerd with those guys on the side, but those aren't the types of questions that I was talking about. It would be things like the concern that was raised before about transparency and access. That's something that I'd heard from constituents, and they appreciated that I managed my own mail server. It's questions like, "What is the confidentiality and access policy for the mail server". Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup mentioned that she's sure that Anthony's not going to sit back there and review emails. I understand that's half-hearted and that's a light comment, but, understand we have a Health Department so we deal with PII (Personally Identifiable Information) and HIPAA (Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act) type data all the time. So, are those same controls for security across all the mail servers, or how's access managed to the server, and how often is it audited?

Mr. Uhl: So, I'll attempt to answer the question without knowing the full workings of it, but, Anthony does not have the capabilities to go in and sift through people's emails. That's a request that we make through NextStep, and they would go in to do it. They are the ones who establish the filters, and they're the ones that would retrieve any email archives that we would potentially need to fulfill a records request or pull information or data from.

Mr. Anderson: So, there was an example of confidential data when we had the committee that we formed to do the Council Investigative Committee. There was confidential information that was emailed and shared in that environment. If we had another confidential committee like that, how would the City manage that server? In that case, our outside law office had us retain records outside of the City services intentionally because there were members of the Administration that were involved in the subpoenas that we were sending out. So, is that stuff that you'll be able to continue to support if we follow this policy? Or would we have to do an exemption in those cases? How would that work? Because, we've had confidential information come in. Not everything that gets emailed to us is a public record. How is that managed?

Mr. Braun: I'll address that as to the litigation and the way that would be handled is you can channel all individuals (or try and wall off individuals) and you can set it up so that only certain people have access to documents so that's something that, if we did have to retain outside counsel for an individual or other individuals that we could obviously preserve and use. That's done all the time in litigation so I don't have a concern about that. But, you did bring something else up that I just wanted to comment on if that's okay, which is you talked about issues in the past, and, something that I think is, it has happened to me before, and it is something that is morbid, but you don't want to think about, but if something were to happen to one of you, and you were to not be here, we would not be able to retrieve your records if we didn't have passwords and accesses to your servers. If you're communicating with others and we got a record request, there isn't an exception to producing public records because the person died. And, then it also goes if someone quits, or if someone leaves Council and then we have to reach out to you in Florida, or wherever you happen to be living when you leave the City of Springdale. So, again, when I use the term "best practice", it's not the perfect practice; it's the best practice. And, I say that because as much as we don't like to think about it, if you were in an accident, and lost your mental faculties, or you were killed, or died for any reason, we would still have the ability to have access to those records without disturbing your family or anyone else. So, I know you have a lot of questions about the technicalities, and I'm sure Anthony can answer those, but, what I would tell you is when you centralize these records into one place, it is the best way to comply and sign what John was talking about where we are, as a City, penalized financially if we don't produce something. Earlier, it was also made that, you know, what is it that provoked this? The only way that we can say something provoked this is for us to have incurred liability, because that's how we would know that we didn't produce something. So, I would rather us be proactive in preventing us from incurring liability rather than waiting until we're fined or we're being sued, and then say, "Oh, we'll change our policy. We'll all agree now that we'll use the City server". I think also the fact that we offered the elected officials the ability to use this system and capture this information is a defense that we could assert for you if someone raised a question. If you affirmatively decline that, and then don't produce a record, I think that there are additional or there are defenses we would not be able to assert on your behalf if that did come forward. So, I just wanted to address those points.

Mr. Anderson: So, did you happen to address the mobile access question and text questions. There was homework after the last session because I know I find it really....

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Braun: This is not part of this policy, and so, I think that's something that we could look at in the future. But, to your point, I don't think we should have a policy that is too expansive and that we can't control, and when Mr. Vanover reached out to me about this, and when staff went back and looked at what we're capable of at this point, we're not going to put something in front of you that we don't think we're capable of managing, and, we're currently capable of managing the email question, but this is separate and apart from text messages. And, if you look at it, it specifically addresses email communications.

Mr. Anderson: And, I'm not against it don't misunderstand just because I have questions it, I just wanted to make sure I'm not losing the ability to connect with the people I connect with. So, right now I have mobile access to my mail, and I get it on my android device, and I get that refreshed in real time. Are there any other policies in terms of device access or email access that come with moving over to the City email address as a policy? Are we taking away the ability and convenience of our elected officials to connect with other people? Because, I'm just concerned because in the last meeting there was discussion about people not able to access the mail for weeks at a time for, I don't know if it was password problems, or a laptop problem, and then when there was the denial of service attack against the City last year related to the goldfish, there were people that were redirected away from the City, so, do we have mobile access and do we have an SLA (service-level agreement) so that we can make sure that we can keep in touch with the way we are now?

Mr. Uhl: Yes, you would still have mobile access. You can still put your Springdale.org account on your mobile device. We do have the ability to get password resets in the event of even after hours through NextStep.

Mr. Anderson: Sorry, what's the password reset? Is that related to the laptop problems you were having?

Mr. Uhl: You made the comment about somebody couldn't access email because a password had been reset, so, I was trying to address your question regarding, to make sure you're not going to be locked out and there are steps involved to get that reset.

Mr. Anderson: So, I'll be able to use the Springdale address on my mobile device. I'm not inheriting a bunch of other security policies around it like mobile wipe or things like that for the device. It's just I disconnect like just an email account.

Mr. Uhl: Just adding another email account to your device. Correct.

Mr. Anderson: Awesome. And then, the City will still continue to send out public records requests to us if the records requests are before the policy takes effect, right? Because I've got five years of public records on my mail server.

Mr. Uhl: Correct.

Mr. Anderson: So, it doesn't...it actually increases work for a little while, but, in the long run, it makes it easier.

Mr. Uhl: Correct. There will be an overlap period, but, yes, moving forward, this will help prevent some of the logistical issues and compliance issues that we would contend with.

Mr. Anderson: Good. Thank you.

Mr. Hawkins: My biggest concern is, it's been stated and Mr. Jacobs was focuses on it, is the lack of notice with regard to addressing this issue. And so, I guess, if we have this brought before us sight unseen with there being something that's urgent going on, then why couldn't we address this next month if there's not something that's urgent going on. If there's something that's urgent, or if this matter was urgent and we had discussion at the last meeting, which was very helpful. I didn't know we had the app where you can download something with your City phone number where it can react to your cellphone or come to your cellphone, which I think is awesome. I plan on utilizing that. But, we had that discussion at the last meeting. If it was urgent from that time to this time, I figured there would be enough

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Hawkins (continued): time to add it to the agenda and to forward the resolution to everybody in advance, if it was urgent. Instead, it's brought to us in the 11<sup>th</sup> hour that it's urgent in the midst of the meeting without the chance to go through and review it. So, my question is there's either urgency or there isn't. I agree with the idea. We are getting a lot of records requests and it's become a big thing as of late, and to make it as easy because we're using a lot of good Administrative people hours and time to go through and fulfill these things, but, it's either an urgent thing or it's not. I think it's something that should be addressed sooner than later at this point, at the same time, I think the idea of this is super-duper important, we discussed at the last meeting, but it wasn't important enough for it to be put on the agenda, addressed where a resolution was made in advance where everybody from Council could see it instead of in the middle of the meeting when we're getting it, that's my biggest issue right now. And, so, I would like to address it next month when people have the opportunity to go through and review it. I'm not asking to wait until October, November, or January or 2023, but, I think, the idea that we're getting it in the middle of the meeting when we did talk about it and I think it's a very good point as the President said; we did talk about it at the last meeting. So, we talked about it at the last meeting, then why am I getting it now? And why wasn't it on the agenda beforehand if it was such an urgent thing? I don't know if anybody can answer that question, but, that's my issue with it right now. What's the difference of us waiting one month where we've had a chance to look at it?

President Vanover: Mr. Hawkins let me ask you this, how much lead time did we get on that ordinance for the ambulance?

Mr. Hawkins: And, that's a fair point. The difference is there's an urgency that's going to cost us \$24,000 if we don't go through and react on that.

President Vanover: But...

Mr. Hawkins: So, that's the difference in that. That's why I'm asking. If someone has something where they say, "This is critical that we have to do this right now." The difference of one week, two weeks, three weeks, four weeks is going to make a problem, then I want to hear that. That's what I'm asking. I think Mr. Jacobs asked it multiple times. So that's what I'm waiting for. I'm not saying, "Let's go out three months."

Mr. Jones: Let's use that number, \$24,000, that's actually 24 pages that we wouldn't produce of public records at \$1,000 a page. We don't have the ability, Mr. Hawkins, and the rest of Council, and elected officials. We have no way to know to sign off saying that we have everything and guarantee that the requestor is getting what they're asking for. You're basically asking us to take your word, and that's not a position that's comfortable for me. I've been doing this for many years in three different cities, and you're asking me to do something I'm very uncomfortable with. I'd like to defer back and refer back to what Mr. Braun said. It's a best practice. It's pretty simple. We watched Hillary Clinton for two years go through this stuff. To me, it's so simple I'm not even sure why we're even having this discussion, quite frankly. Not to be disrespectful for those that have a different opinion on this matter, but, as your Administrator, to me, this seems so simple. Just do what we're asking you to do meaning with regard to everybody on the same policy so when those records are requested, there is no doubt that we can fill those records. Otherwise, is the penalty still \$1,000 per page for failure to provide those records?

Mr. Braun: \$500.

Mr. Jones: \$500? Alright, sorry. I don't want that on our City. That \$24,000 we talked about is going to come up pretty quick if we can't fill them. We have no way of knowing that. And, quite frankly, have a lot of respect for everybody up here, but I don't want to just take your word, Meghan (Sullivan-Wisecup), or anybody else, that you provided that to me. I want to know for a fact, so when the Law Director says, "Did you fill that public records (request), I can say, "Yes, we did. We have everything according to anything we could possibly have." Anything other than that, that's objective, filling of a record doesn't work for me. So, I'm speaking with a little bit of passion here. But, the reason why I'm doing that is because it's the best practice. I think that's hard to argue.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Hawkins: And Mr. Jones, I appreciate that. I'm not saying this isn't the best practice. Here's what I'm saying. We can't have this both ways. We discussed this at our last meeting on July 6<sup>th</sup>, right? And, so, we had a discussion, everybody was present. If it was critical that we do this because we're worried about \$500 a record, or what have you, then why didn't we have it said and added to the agenda in advance with the resolution put out to all the members of Council and elected officials if it was critical. This is my point. We can't have it both ways. It's either very important that we have to act, and, if so, then from the meeting we had July 6<sup>th</sup>, we would have been acting with fervor to make sure this was ready to go and on the agenda and we would have all had notice of it. That's my issue. I'm not saying or criticizing this policy right here. I'm just getting to read it tonight, right now while we're talking about it. Trying not to talk about it or read it while we had other ordinances coming up. But, that's my thing. You can't have it both ways. It's one or the other. I'm not saying it's not important, but, what I am saying is why could we have some time to look over it beforehand. And, so that's my only point. If it was so important when we had this last discussion and it was critical to bring this up, then, it should have been done in advance. This, and I don't know what the process was, but, it makes me think that it must have been something that came at the last minute, which makes me think, well, how critical could it have been from two weeks ago if we're getting it at the last minute and it wasn't added to the agenda. That way my question really in terms of why, process wise, are we dealing with it tonight and it wasn't done in advance if it's such an important thing. And, I'm not saying that making sure we're clear on the policy, making sure we're transparent isn't important to do, but, why am I getting it now, and why do we have to go through this tonight? Why is it a terrible thing to set this out? And, again, I don't even put that on Council if the matter was tabled, because we just got it. And, if it was so important in advance, then we should have had it in advance. It should have been on the agenda in advance. That's my point.

Mayor Webster: Well, I turned this light on several minutes ago, so I think the point that I wanted to make, and Mr. Braun did a very good job of it. To address Mr. Jacobs' comments that what brought this to a head here is did something transpire. The answer is no, but we're trying to be proactive here with this, and this is something, and this sort of addresses Mr. Hawkins' concern too. This is not something that just came out of left field. This is something that has been talked about over and over, and over again. Now, I'm not sitting here trying to defend how it got on the agenda tonight. You have a good point. Maybe that should have been made very clear last Council meeting that we're going to have a resolution on the agenda. And, anyway, if enough people feel uneasy about that, then table it to a date that's specific. If you just table it, it automatically comes up at the next meeting, but if you could put a date on that. Right Mr. Braun?

Mr. Braun: That's an option.

Mayor Webster: So, if four people have that concern, then table it to a date, the second meeting in August. I think we'll be missing some people at the first meeting in August, so, find a date where we think everybody is going to be here, and table it to that date. But, I really, getting back to Mr. Jacobs, why wait until we get sued. Why wait until, like Mr. Jones said, he's signing off on these things saying, "Yes, this is all we've got." And then all we need to do is for somebody to come staggering in and say, "Oh no you don't. I had this email with so and so on this date and you didn't report it. I'm going to sue the City." There we go. And so, why wait until that happens. Especially when this is an adopted policy and procedure. It's best practices, as Mr. Braun has said in all of his other cities, this is happening. I think in your Council training sessions I think you cover that do you not on new Council people?

Mr. Braun: Yes, we've encouraged it here as well, I know. When I met with Mr. Jacobs he talked about it. I encourage it, and if you're taught that way from once you're elected, you really kind of do follow that. That's what you did (addressing Mr. Jacobs).

Mayor Webster: So, as Mr. Jones says, this is his third city. The other two have done this. I don't know about the State Parole Board, whether they had similar type policies, but, this is not something that somebody concocted in the backroom, well, let's do this, let's pull this on City Council. That's not the way that happened at all. But, here again, I'm not sitting here defending the way it got on the agenda tonight.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Jacobs: Yes, I want to make it clear. I've used the City email since I took the seat. I have no intention of not doing that on my own. I've probably got a grand total of three or four constituent emails since I got up here, but, to me, my question about is there an instigation here was because of the timing. This could be best practice, and I could agree with that, but, it's not best practice to throw it front of me and have me read it while other people are talking. I'm not comfortable with that, and we could have done better and what's the harm in waiting a couple of weeks is my question at this point. Even if I accept that this is best practice and we want the best appearance of transparency that we can get, what do we lose in two weeks when I can digest this a little bit. I heard that Carolyn is, like maybe hear from members who don't use the City email, because, again, I do, but it's not a best practice to throw it in front of me like this. At least I don't feel that way. Thank you.

Mr. Anderson: Don't misunderstand my questions. I didn't come in, I knew we talked about this last meeting, and so I was giving a lot of thought to what I would want to see or how that would do because I've gotten so used to five years of using my personal server and I know that I can get those records quickly like we did on that last giant request that came through. I was able to produce those records very quickly so, when I heard us talking about it, that was the mindset I was in. I was like, "Well, I can do it just as well". I hadn't considered the points Mr. Jones was making where he's signing off on my work, so, that's certainly given me something to think about in that regard. I hadn't considered that you're signing off on my ability to check my mail server, so I appreciate the situation that puts you in. The challenge I have with doing it tonight is this last part of it. Even in our meeting last time, we talked about, you know, people would forward mail so, I'm surprised to see that last section where we can't forward mail anymore even if we had a City address, having it forwarded to another address. That's something that we didn't talk about last time which is why I need to think about that. Here's the real challenge I have, notwithstanding Mr. Hawkins or Mr. Jacobs concern about process or getting it on the record quickly. If I knew this resolution, if this was sent out, what I would have done is asked to get set up on the City email so I could try it and see it. I understand Administration's concern is compliance and transparency. My concern are those as well; transparency, accountability, but also access. I'd like the opportunity to try the City email address on my phone first and make sure that I can continue to interact with the people that I do, without any problems. If we could table it for a month so the people who don't use it have a chance to try it and see what the problems are. It may be a non-event. It may be a non-issue. Without using it, I can't support a policy change because I don't know if it's going to make it more difficult for me to do my job. If I have the opportunity to try it and switch over and make sure that it works the way that I'm used to, then I think it is a "no-brainer" then, because it gives you that accountability and access that you're asking for. But, it can't be at the expense of availability and access that I have to work with people. So, I would like the opportunity to try it before we make it a policy. And, the other thing, even though we're not on the nation stage, the comment about Hillary and her emails; that was about confidential information, not about having a public or private server. That doesn't apply here at all. That's not anything to do with what we're doing here. The email concerns that happen at the federal level aren't the same thing as records retention that we're doing with public records, so, I'm not sure I understood that concern. But, yes, I would ask that we wait until, even if you'd rather have it be two meetings, so we have a full Council to vote on it. I would ask to have the opportunity to try it first before we make it a policy. But, obviously, we can do what we want. Thank you.

President Vanover: Well, we have a motion and a second out there. So...

Mr. Anderson: I'd like to make a motion to table Resolution (No. R15-2022), the current resolution we're discussing and take it up again.

President Vanover: We have a motion and a second. So, you can't make a motion.

Mr. Anderson: I can make a motion to table.

Mr. Braun: He can make a motion to table.

President Vanover: Okay.

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mr. Braun: It's immediately; it's not debatable though. You have to make the motion to vote. There's no debate.

President Vanover: Okay.

Mr. Anderson : Yes. I'd like to make a motion to table the current resolution for our second meeting in August. Resolution No. R15-2022, for our second August regular meeting.

Mr. Jacobs: Second.

President Vanover: No discussion, correct?

Motion to table Resolution No. R15-2022 for the second August regular meeting passes with six affirmative votes, and one opposing vote (Vanover).

President Vanover: Resolution No. R15-2022 will be back on our August 17<sup>th</sup> meeting.

### Old Business

Mr. Anderson: I think it's Old Business. We talked about it during Communications with the Audience. Would it be possible to get an update on the Mixed Use Master Plan progress at our next meeting. Is that something we can add to the agenda or get an update from Administration on? I know there's a lot of work going on with the consultants on that. I don't need it tonight. I want to make sure you're prepared for it.

Mr. Uhl: Are you referring to the connectivity piece?

Mr. Anderson: Yes. The mixed use, multi-use, the shared paths, and the consultants.

Mr. Uhl: I'll defer to Andy (Kuchta) for just a second. Are we going to be in a position where we can share additional information? I know they're still finalizing some connectivity pieces; some surveys.

Mr. Kuchta: We will be able to provide an update at the next meeting, but, in the next I believe week or so, there's going to be a new round of communications from the City via Facebook, and on our website with a set of draft maps, route maps, short-term, and then long-term maps, and we're going to be asking the public to provide comments on those and take a look at those over the next three or four weeks in preparation for an August public engagement meeting. Prior to then, hopefully in September, bringing a draft plan in front of Planning Commission for review, and ideally the recommendation to Council and then to Council by the end of September for presentation review, and hopefully adoption of that plan. So, we can give an update, but, it's not going to be a whole lot more than, "Here's the draft maps that have been up now for a couple of weeks". We're receiving comments on those, and that's going to be it at that point.

Mr. Anderson: Now, even having the date updates tonight is great because I don't think we've communicated a lot since that last round closed, so, just knowing the dates, even if it's just in your notebook. We don't need to do a formal presentation, but, if we can just update the dates in progress, that would be really helpful.

### New Business

President Vanover: Well I have an item in New Business that Council, for we can talk about it on the 17<sup>th</sup> (of August). There are big rental problem issues going on; Heritage Hill specifically. I know the other neighborhoods are affected. Right now, my last tally, Heritage Hill was approaching 25% rental. And, with that comes issues of the number of people in a household, number of cars parked on the street, sometimes in front yards. And, it's only going to continue, and I know we're not the only community battling this because we did, it's been a few months back, search of our neighboring communities, and everybody is fighting the same problem, but they're not doing anything. And, that makes no sense. So, get your thinking caps on. The intent will be that we would forward this to there's two possible committees that I

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

President Vanover (continued): have in mind; one of them is the Housing Committee, but, you know, or, we form a new committee. The other one could possibly be Rules and Laws, but, I don't know that that fits in to it. So, with that, figure on the 17<sup>th</sup> that we'll have discussion on that.

Mr. Hawkins: Is it an issue, as you see, as a lack of legislation in terms of code that we would have in terms of, I haven't looked at it right now, you can park in your front lawn, or how many cars can be in front of the house? Do you think it's a code issue or do you think it's an enforcement issue? Or do you think it's a combination of both that we need address?

President Vanover: It could be a combination of both. It's a life safety issue because when (the) Fire Department shows up, one of the first questions they ask is how many people are in the house. The number of cars; we have had several near-misses coming down in two spots I can tell you right now; coming down the hill off of Tivoli on Ledro, and then after you pass the entrance to Chamberlain Park going up because those are "S" type curves and you meet somebody coming head-on, if you're heading down Ledro toward my house, you have to yield. Well, there are times that there is no place to bail out. So, this is, and it has been ongoing, as a matter of fact, I approached Mr. (Derrick) Parham about this several years ago, and, you see where we are. So, with that...

Mr. Anderson: I had a similar question as Mr. Hawkins. Are we thinking this is an enforcement or a building code type problem, and it sounds like it's going to be more than that. I agree. I mean, you know my parents are still over in Heritage Hill. I'm there all the time. I grew up there. You definitely have seen a change in the character of the community, and I don't know if it's rentals per se. I know we talked before about also doing some more outreach, especially targeting people who rent homes to welcome them into the community too. So, I'd like to expand the thinking a little bit when we talk about the rental challenges for homes. It's definitely increasing; that we look at both building code and enforcement, but, also, what can we do to engage those, either the homeowners or the renters directly as they come in because, I mean, a lot of those people want the same things, right? The people that I talk to that are renting over in Heritage Hill two doors down from my parents, they want to know how they can get more involved and engaged, and I think that also helps some of those problems that you talked about parking in the yard, or being a respectful neighbor, or what are the norms; when do you put your garbage out. That kind of stuff. So, I think there's an opportunity to not just do legislation, but also outreach, so maybe it's something that multiple committees are tasked with a different part of the challenge, right? Maybe there's a piece for Planning, right to look at the rental codes. Maybe there's a piece for ordinances where we can look at caps or better reporting for renters when they come in, and then maybe there's an opportunity for the Public Relations Committee to relaunch kind of that engagement stuff that we started a couple of years ago, so I think we should use all three prongs. Thank you.

Mrs. McNear: I don't know if you all have seen it, but the Enquirer had a very large article in the paper on Sunday this past week, and it was about this specific problem about rentals, and that there are several companies that are going in and buying up every house that they can get their hands on, and I think that's generating a lot of the problems that we have too, because you have not just a rental property here and there, but they're buying up whole banks of homes in relatively inexpensive neighborhoods, and then they control all the houses. They're saying that 25+% of the houses are owned by a couple of companies. And, not just Springdale, but, in the Cincinnati area and across the country. But, we see this every day across all the neighborhoods, and you're right; people are parking in the grass, there are multiple cars. We don't even know how many people live there. We don't know how many people are registered with the City, which means they aren't paying taxes to use the benefits of living in this City, and it just goes on and on. Thank you.

Mayor Webster: Well, it's pretty evident that the legislation that we have on the books is not working. I mean, there is absolutely no way that our Building Department or anybody else's building department can enforce how many families are living in that house. I mean it's absolutely impossible. You've got to camp outside. The court won't just take one snapshot; you've got to have a record of it; how many days in a two-week period; so many people leave here at 5:00 in the morning, or go back at 5:00 at night, or whatever. So, what we've got on the books just will not work, and, I would hate to see to just throw this on Dan (Jacobs) and

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Mayor Webster (continued): Carolyn (Ghantous) and say, "Here Rules and Laws, figure this out". I think it's a much bigger problem than that. And, I think it's one that needs some input from Council, we need some input from the Building Department, we need it from Public Safety, and so I would love to see Council form maybe a "super committee" if you will to study this problem and let's take a look at what other communities are doing. Because it's not a problem that's just unique to Springdale. And, now to follow up on Kathy's (McNear) comment there, I just heard today that across the street, Springrose Meadows; 50 new houses; 14, or 28% are rentals. Some of those houses go in excess of \$400,000, now some don't; some are \$280,000, I don't know how low they go, but, anyway, I've heard that some of them go as low as \$280,000. But, still in all, 14 out of 50 houses. Now, Andy (Kuchta) did you tell me we have 400 rental permits, or 600 out of 2,400 single-family structures we have in the City. How many is it? Four (hundred) or six (hundred)?

Mr. Kuchta: So, the most current data that I have, that I got from the Building Department through their rental inspection program of single-family homes was from February this year, and we had to clean up that list because it was kind of a mish-mash database that had been created over time. Once we cleaned it up, we ended up with 399 single-family homes that were registered as rentals. Keep in mind that the Building Department staff fully believes that the number is actually much higher than that because it's a voluntary program, and we know there's people out there that are renting their homes that are not applying for these permits for this inspection. So, I actually spoke with them earlier this week about getting updated data, and I expect to have that in the near future, but maybe we can map that out and see where they're at.

Mayor Webster: So, in the best-case scenario, one out of every six houses is a rental in the City of Springdale. I think that deserves some attention because, right now, we've got a major problem in Heritage Hill because we've got so many rentals, and also I think because the streets are somewhat narrower than some of the other subdivisions. They were built before some of the new regulations went into effect, and that just compounds it. But, it's a major problem in this City, and I think we need more than just Dan (Jacobs) and Carolyn (Ghantous) to try to solve this for us.

President Vanover: I agree, as a matter of fact, I can, it's not just Heritage Hill. When I was out last year, the Crossings on the hill. I had several residents complain because the management company bought the units when they went up for sale, and now they're renting them.

Mayor Webster: I'm glad you brought that up. This just came to my attention in the last couple of months thanks to Mrs. Ghantous here. But, I'd just like to address this to the people in Springdale. There are certain things you can't do when you're ready to sell your house, because you'll be guilty of discrimination. You can't say, "Yes, I'm not going to sell to this color person, or this race, or whatever", but the one thing you can do; you can tell the realtor, "I do not want to sell this to a rental company"; and you're not discriminating. And, I think that a lot of people don't realize that and so they say, "Well, I can't put that in there; I'll get sued". Well, that's not the case. I mean, the court has upheld it. They're not a protected class, the people who buy homes to rent them out are not a protected class. So, you're allowed to exclude those people. And, the more rental companies we exclude from owning property in Springdale, the better off Springdale is.

Mr. Jacobs: Thank you. My question was mostly answered already. I was asking about how we got that data and so it seems like it's probably under-reported. A fairly serious amount. That's where your 25% number came from?

President Vanover: Oh, no. That's me doing the legwork, pulling the list of rentals, so, yes, that is the minimum and, like I said, I've gotten feedback from other areas that this is not unique to my neighborhood. And, I can tell you right now I've looked at three homes that are for rent; one of them right around the corner from me was over \$1,800 a month. One on Mallet was \$1,750 a month, and one on the corner of Benadir and Ledro was \$1,300 a month. So, these aren't cheap rentals. Somebody is making some money. So, it's a multi-faceted thing, and it's not going to be a quick solution by any measure of the word, but, and these big-

## City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

President Vanover (continued): box rental companies, I got wind of that article Sunday, and parts of that article are not favorable to them at all because of problems and lackadaisical attitudes that they had.

Mr. Anderson: I agree. Although I think those rent numbers sound low based on what we're seeing in the apartments coming in. I mean, if it was me, I can rent a house in Heritage Hill for \$1,700, or one of these two bedrooms for \$2,200 that they're going for in some of these areas. You can see why they want those homes purchased to be rented out. They go quick. I just want to make sure that as we do that committee that we keep the focus on what we can do to make sure that proper community spirit is maintained. Because I don't think being a renter is inherently wrong or bad. We bring in all these apartments, renting a home is, I think the only way some of these families can get into homes these days because costs are so high, and the rates have gone so high, so I just want to make sure that we're very deliberate when we go through that Committee work that it's how do we get the behavior and engagement with the residents and maybe managing the rental companies and in no way discouraging the renters of being anything less than full is the term we agreed upon Springdalians? I don't remember. That's what I've heard a few times. I think rental, especially for young families, is the reality these days more and more. You can't find \$200,000 homes, \$300,000 homes anymore anywhere. They go through multiple offers and they disappear in days. So, I think rentals are a reality, and I want them to be welcomed here too.

President Vanover: Well, I might argue with you because a house over on Tivoli, I was talking to Carolyn (Ghantous) last meeting, \$220,000. So, the numbers are out there, and they are high. So, let's keep moving.

Mrs. McNear: Related to Springrose Subdivision, I monitor the real estate in Springdale. I check the real estate site almost every day. It's rare that I go two or three days without checking, and, one day I saw Springrose pop up. And, there were 15, 16 houses that were listed, all but I think two were listed; \$237,000; one at \$257,000. Right now, there's only one house left there; that's the \$257,000. I thought that was so odd that every one of those houses would be sold on the same couple of days for the exact same price. So, I contacted Mrs. Ghantous. I said, "What the heck is this all about? This doesn't seem normal even in this strange real estate market that we have today." So, she checked into it and got back to me and she said, "Well all of those are rentals." They were purchased brand new as rentals. And, I don't understand. I mean, people are desperate to buy homes and we have all these brand new houses that are going as rentals. It's just very frustrating. I have a rental property surrounded by other rental property and I can tell you that I am not happy with either my renter and the properties that are around it because, you know, it's just like we talked about. People are parking in the grass, they're not putting their garbage cans where they should be. The grass isn't mowed as it should be. And, there's wild parties and the people who are surrounding them don't want to report them. Too many cars, it's really very frustrating to everyone who has to live around all that. Thank you.

Mrs. Ghantous: I think it's a big topic. It's going to take a lot of work. But, it's imperative that we focus on the conditions and not the people. Period. We can't lose sight of that.

President Vanover: Well, the only caveat I would put on that, the people I'm interested in are the landlords. Because, that's where a lot of the problem arises. They're taking those rent checks and going to the bank. I don't have an issue with the renters other than maybe numbers or something like that but, when somebody is making, I mean, let's face it, rental properties is a business, and, when they're making money and degrading other homes in the neighborhood, people that have spent their life savings and life earnings on a property and they're forced to live with some of these issues. I talked to a guy that we had men in a rental house that was urinating outside on the side of the house; in clear sight of their property. So, yes, that's a behavior thing. But, you know, it's legit. I heard it hot and heavy and it's not getting any better. We beat that horse for now. We'll move on.

City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Executive Session – Economic Development

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I move that we go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22 (G)(2) and pursuant to the City Charter to discuss Economic Development.

President Vanover: Do we have a second?

Mrs. Ghantous: Second.

Mr. Braun: Before you vote, I was asked by Council while we're with our livestreaming audience tonight to make a statement about City executive sessions and I wanted to do that for the members of the audience that are present as well as our streaming audience. And that is that over the course of next several months City Council will be going into Executive Sessions on a more frequent basis. We're doing this to discuss, primarily, the lease or purchase of property and under the lease or purchase of property and economic development related to the Artisan Village development, which is also the former Tri-County Mall site. This is taking place to update Council, and to discuss the status of ongoing negotiations with the developer regarding the potential relocation of the Community Center, and, other real estate matters that are related to that proposed development. Once their negotiations result in a concrete proposal, we want to assure the general public that it is the intent of City Council to present that proposal at a public meeting for input and discussion by anyone that is interested. Thank you.

Mr. Anderson: I just wanted to say I appreciate the extra comment. I know we're not required to do that. We can go into Executive Session and we do frequently for good reasons. But, this is the kind of thing where having all of that detail negotiation in public actually hurts the public, and our interests in general. It's like negotiating in the open and that's not a good idea. So, I just wanted to say I appreciate Administration putting together that comment. I agree. I'm generally against things being done in secret, just like all of us are. We want to be as open as we can. But, it is happening more frequently. I've gotten questions about it, so, I appreciate you putting that together and letting people know that it's just going to be the way that it is for the next few months at least. Thank you.

The motion to go into Executive Session for Economic Development passed with a 7-0 vote. Council departed chambers at 9:05 p.m. Council returned to chambers at 9:52 p.m.

Meetings and Announcements

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Planning Commission will meet on August 9<sup>th</sup> at 7:00 p.m.

Mr. Anderson: Board of Zoning Appeals is cancelled for this month. I think I said it last time, but I don't remember the date, no meeting this month.

Mr. Uhl: Civil Service will meet on Thursday, August 4<sup>th</sup> at 2:00 p.m.

Communications from the Audience

-

None

City of Springdale Council

July 20, 2022

Update on legislation still in development

Mr. Hawkins: As you review your Internal Memorandum, Item Number I was addressed with Ordinance No. 22-2022; An Ordinance Authorizing Contributions to Certain Health Accounts of Full-Time Employees of the City of Springdale Related to the City's Health Insurance Plan and Declaring an Emergency. That passed with a 7-0 vote. Item Number II was added to the agenda and addressed with Ordinance No. 23-2022; An Ordinance Accepting a Proposal Under the State of Ohio Cooperative Purchasing Program and Authorizing the Mayor and Clerk of Council/Finance Director to Enter into an Agreement with Horton Emergency Vehicles in the Amount of \$355,427 for the Purchase of a New Ambulance and Declaring an Emergency. That passed with a 7-0 vote. We also had Resolution No. R15-2022 added to the agenda with regard to A Resolution Adopting a Policy for the City of Springdale, Ohio Relating to Elected Officials Regarding E-mail Communications. That is tabled until the August 17<sup>th</sup>, 2022 meeting with a 6-1 vote.

Recap of legislative items requested for next Council meeting

Mr. Hawkins: There's nothing specifically listed unless there's anything else from Council or the Administration.

Adjournment

Mr. Hawkins made a motion to adjourn; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded the motion and Council adjourned at 9:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kathy McNear  
Clerk of Council/Finance Director

Minutes Approved:  
Tom Vanover, President of Council

\_\_\_\_\_, 2022